#### PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICES FOR FOSTERING MATHEMATICAL CREATIVITY IN PROOF-BASED COURSES: THREE CASE STUDIES

Milos Savic David Plaxco Gulden Karakok Emily Cilli-Turner Gail Tang Houssein El Turkey

Mohamed Omar

## THE CREATIVITY RESEARCH GROUP



# CPR ON PROVING

- Creativity-in-Progress Rubric on Proving (Savic et al., 2016; Karakok et al., 2015, 2016; El Turkey et al., under revision)
- Two categories:
  - Taking risks
  - Making Connections
- First created as a research tool, but has morphed into a tool for teacher and student use

# WHAT IS CREATIVITY?

- Over 100 definitions (Mann, 2006)
- A process of offering new solutions or insights that are unexpected for the student, with respect to his/her mathematics background or the problems s/he has seen before (Sriraman & Liljedahl, 2006)
- In general, "Creativity refers to anything someone does in a way that is original to the creator and that is appropriate to the purpose or goal of the creator." (Sriraman, 2015)

#### HOW DO WE "TEACH" CREATIVITY?

- Mathematical creativity in undergraduate teaching
- From Zazkis and Holton (2009):
  - Learner-generated examples (Watson & Mason, 2005)
  - Counter-examples (Koichu, 2008)
  - Multiple solutions (Leikin 2007, 2009)
  - Changing parameters (Brown & Walter, 1983)
- "At the collegiate level, however, very little empirical research has yet described and analyzed the practices of teachers of mathematics" (Speer, Smith & Horvath, 2010, p. 99)

## TEACHING PRACTICES – K-12

- Levenson (2011, 2013) Collaborative creativity
  - choosing appropriate tasks,
  - fostering a safe environment where students can challenge norms without fear of repercussion,
  - playing the role of expert participant by providing a breakdown of the mathematics behind a process, and
  - setting the pace, allowing for incubation periods. (Levenson, 2013, p. 273)

#### TEACHING PRACTICES – K-12

• Sriraman (2005) – 5 principles for maximizing creativity



# FIVE PRINCIPLES

- Gestalt
  - Opportunities to engage in the four-stage creative process (Wallas, 1926; Hadamard, 1945)
    - Preparation, incubation, insight, verification
- Aesthetic
  - Teacher valuing solutions that utilize unusual proving techniques, come from diverse topics of mathematics, or make efficient or elegant solutions

# FIVE PRINCIPLES (CONT.)

- Free Market
  - Creating a classroom environment that allows students to freely input ideas, thoughts, and solutions
- Scholarly
  - creating a classroom environment "in which students are encouraged to debate and question the validity of... approaches to problems..., be encouraged to generalize the problem and/or the solution, as well as pose a class of analogous problems" (p. 28)
- Uncertainty
  - "Students be exposed to the uncertainty and the difficulty of creating mathematics" (p. 28)

# **RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

- What teacher actions or practices in the proof-based tertiary classroom might foster students' perceptions of mathematical creativity?
- Do the five principles apply to undergraduate teaching?
- In particular, how does the CPR on Proving enhance the potential for mathematical creativity in a proofbased classroom according to the five principles?

# DATA COLLECTION

- Three collections of data
  - Teachers' impressions (diaries, goals, interviews)
  - Teachers' instruction (Livescribe<sup>™</sup> data, notes)
  - Students' impressions (online survey, interviews, homework)
- Preliminarily coding teacher actions using the five principles, then using student data to corroborate effectiveness of teacher action

## HOUSSEIN'S CLASS - SETTING

- 6 students, Number Theory course, Fall 2015
- Houssein explained the rubric in one class period (third week)
- Led discussion by asking about subcategories in CPR
- Had co-constructions of proofs in class, and would refer to the rubric to push proving further
- Students were formally asked to use CPR five times in the course
  - Homework as an evaluation tool
  - During the final for extra credit

## MOHAMED'S CLASS - SETTING

- 18 students, Combinatorics course, Spring 2016
- Active Learning Hybrid
- Used rubric for "portfolio problems"
  - "much more involved, and the intention is to allow freedom to roam with it in any direction you wish."
  - One portfolio problem worth three exercises
  - Minimum 3-page essay summarizing the proving process the students used
  - Open problems in Combinatorics

## GAIL'S CLASS - SETTING

- 14 Students, Transition to proof course, Spring 2016
- Utilized rubric language before introducing CPR
- Reflections throughout the course asking about mathematical creativity
- Showed an attempt from a previous course and attempts from the current students, and had students in group discussion evaluate the students' work using CPR

#### UNCERTAINTY PRINCIPLE

 "Mathematics at the professional level is full of uncertainty and ambiguity...Creating, as opposed to learning, requires that students be exposed to the uncertainty and the difficulty of creating mathematics" (Sriraman, 2005, p. 28)

## UNCERTAINTY PRINCIPLE

- Mohamed Portfolio problems were never graded on completion, but rather progress, and some were open problems
- Gail Not answering correctness or validity questions right away
- Houssein Getting stuck in class while proving a theorem on two occasions (having to switch techniques) and discussing this episode with students after completing the proof on the third occasion

#### UNCERTAINTY – STUDENTS

- Mohamed "You could approach different parts of the problem that it wasn't about getting an answer as much as just kind of exploring relationships...this idea that you could actually kind of like create or notice relationships that are like, like in kind of like new ways rather than just kind of like following a template...
- Gail "There were times like 'Well I did this proof, but I'm not sure it's right because of this' and she would respond with 'Well, what do you think class?' And the class would participate in it...And it's just, using each other and building off of each other in the class to build what we need, create, made us creative. It built that creative environment for us.

Creativity Research Group - Teaching to Foster Creativity

#### UNCERTAINTY – STUDENTS

- Mohamed "You could approach different parts of the problem that it wasn't about getting an answer as much as just kind of exploring relationships...this idea that you could actually kind of like create or notice relationships that are like, like in kind of like new ways rather than just kind of like following a template...
- Gail "There were times like 'Well I did this proof, but I'm not sure it's right because of this' and she would respond with 'Well, what do you think class?' And the class would participate in it...And it's just, using each other and building off of each other in the class to build what we need, create, made us creative. It built that creative environment for us.

## AESTHETIC PRINCIPLE

- Instructors valuing solutions that utilize unusual proving techniques, come from diverse topics of mathematics, or make efficient or elegant solutions
  - Gail "...That's the exam 2 'solutions' and I say solutions in quotes because they're not all 100% correct, okay, but it doesn't matter. You know there are still really good ideas in there and that's what I want you to see."
  - Student "I think tools and tricks especially, because ...there's always different ways to go about it... I feel like with the tools and tricks it's hard for any two proofs to be exactly alike."

#### FREE MARKET PRINCIPLE

- "...teachers should encourage students to take risks" (Sriraman, 2005, p. 28)
  - Houssein Asking questions using the rubric's language to encourage students in class
    - Have you made a connection to Theorem T? Or Def A? Have you generated an example to help understand the statement?
  - Student (On being creative in the course)

     "I would say yes... we were given our books to look back...I found one of the questions on the test to be almost exactly like one of the theorems, so I related it directly to that theorem, and it was like two chapters previous, like no one was thinking that far back."

# PRE-CONCLUSION

- There are signs that using the five principles may shed light on the commonalities of teaching actions between the three case studies
- The CPR on Proving is a "vocabulary package" that might be a tool to utilize the five principles
  - "Tools and tricks"

## FUTURE RESEARCH

- The CPR allowed students to take a metacognitive look at their own proving process
- "Creative actions might benefit from meta-cognitive skills and vice versa, regarding the knowledge of one's own cognition and the regulation of the creative process" (Katz and Stupel, 2015, p. 69)

"SO I THINK THAT LIKE EVERYONE'S CAPABLE OF MATHEMATICAL CREATIVITY. I THINK THAT MATHEMATICAL CREATIVITY IS NOT REALLY KIND OF TAUGHT OR NOT MADE ACCESSIBLE TO PEOPLE, SO I THINK PEOPLE A LOT OF TIMES DON'T REALIZE THAT THEY'RE CAPABLE OF BEING CREATIVE."

#### THANK YOU!

Email: savic@ou.edu

## QUESTIONS TO AUDIENCE...

- How can you "evaluate" your teaching of soft skills like creativity or metacognition?
- Are there either frameworks or literature that may assist the five principles by Sriraman (2005)?
- Is there a quality component to implementing the five principles? Can one use a principle without fostering any creativity from the students?